



Ali Bhutto`s Socialist Practice in Pakistan: Theory, Policy, and Influence

Xiuqin Yang¹, Jiang Lan^{2,3*}

¹ Teaching Assistants, School of Marxism, Tianfu College of SWUFE, 621000, China;

² Department of Tourism, History and Culture, Southwest Minzu University, 610041, China;
lanjiang1016@163.com

³ China (Kunming) Institute of South and Southeast Asian Studies, Yunnan Academy of Social Sciences, China;lanjiang1016@163.com

*Corresponding Author Email : lanjiang1016@163.com

Abstract: The practice of Islamic socialism by former Pakistani Prime Minister Ali Bhutto holds an important position in Pakistan's development process. Ali Bhutto's theory of Islamic socialism holds that socialism is applicable to Muslim countries such as Pakistan. Socialism can promote social and economic equality in Pakistan, democracy and socialism must develop together, and all enterprises in Pakistan's national economic infrastructure must be public enterprises. Ali Bhutto's Islamic socialist policies include nationalization of industrial and financial institutions, land reform, labor reform, and education reform. Ali Bhutto's Islamic socialism has had a significant impact on Pakistan's politics, economy, and other aspects.

Keywords: Ali Bhutto; Islamic Socialism; Theory; Policies; Influence

Introduction

In 1948, the Communist Party of Pakistan was established. But socialism was truly adopted and put into practice by national leaders in Pakistan during the reign of Ali Bhutto. Therefore, this article chooses to focus on Ali Bhutto's practice of Islamic socialism in Pakistan. The academic research on Ali Bhutto's socialist practice in Pakistan can be roughly divided into three categories: the first category tells the general history of Pakistan, involving Bhutto's Islamic socialist practice in Pakistan, but does not focus on theoretical discussion, and the narrative theme is not centered on Islamic socialism, but focuses on many political reforms. ^[1] The second category focuses on sorting out the history of socialist development since the establishment of the Communist Party of Pakistan. However, Bhutto's socialist practice is not described in detail in such studies. ^[2] The third category focuses on discussing Bhutto's socialist practice in Pakistan, but the induction of his Islamic socialist theory is incomplete, without pointing out the specific practice and corresponding impact of Bhutto's Islamic socialism in the economic field. ^[3]

I Ali Bhutto's Islamic Socialist Theory

Ali Bhutto's socialist theory integrates socialist concepts, Islamic beliefs, and democratic ideas, presenting an inclusive feature. Therefore, Ali Bhutto's socialist theory is called Islamic socialist theory. In April 1968, Ali Bhutto announced on behalf of the Pakistan People's Party: Islam is our faith; Democracy is our polity; Socialism is our economy; All power to the people. ^[4] Specifically, Ali Bhutto's theory of Islamic socialism mainly includes the following important concepts:

1.1 Socialism Applies to Muslim Countries such as Pakistan

Ali Bhutto has repeatedly explained that socialist and Islamic beliefs are not mutually exclusive. In April 1968, Bhutto pointed out: Islam and the principles of socialism are not mutually repugnant. Islam preaches equality and socialism is the modern technique of attaining it. Dr. Mohammad Iqbal, Pakistan's great poet-philosopher, dreamed of Pakistan as an Islamic state having a socialist system. Only a part of his dream has come true. Pakistan is a Muslim state but its piratical form of capitalism, which has wrought havoc upon the people, is a violation of Islamic tenets. The Founder of Pakistan, Mohamed Ali Jinnah, declared on more than one occasion that Pakistan would be an Islamic state with a socialist form of government. In a speech in Delhi in April 1943, the Quaid visualized Pakistan as having 'a People's Government' and warned 'landlords and capitalists who have flourished at our expense by a system which is so vicious, which is so wicked, which makes men so selfish that it is difficult to reason with them ... the constitution and the government will be what the people will decide.' ^[4]

In the same speech, Ali Bhutto said: Objective study shows that there is no conflict between Islam and socialism. If there were any incompatibility, neither the poet-philosopher of Pakistan nor its Founder would have advocated socialism. Their views are on record, and there is no point in joining issues with rootless individuals who, under the shelter of this Government, have had the audacity to contradict the Father of the Nation. [4]

On October 26, 1968, Ali Bhutto delivered a speech in Peshawar, clarifying that socialism does not have any conflict with Islam, and that Muslim countries such as Egypt, Algeria, Indonesia, and South Yemen implement socialist systems that do not make Muslims infidels: Socialism is not against Islam. There is no conflict between the two whatsoever. Had that been the case there would have been no socialism in Egypt. Are all Muslims of Egypt infidels? Why is there socialism in Algeria? Why was there socialism in Indonesia during the time of President Soekarno? Why is Southern Yemen establishing a socialist system? [5]

Ali Bhutto believes that socialism is universally applicable to many countries, including Muslim countries like Pakistan; Socialism will benefit Pakistan. In April 1968, Bhutto pointed out that: The scope of socialism is imaginable. Apart from countries that have experienced revolutionary processes, there are also many countries, including even constitutional monarchies, where the requirements of socialism have been gradually realized without drastic changes. The universality of socialist principles is essentially due to two reasons: firstly, the foundation of modern socialism is objective; secondly, socialist ideology and the economic and political relations of various countries around the world adapt to reality. Therefore, socialism has a direct interest in Pakistan, an underdeveloped country full of internal and external exploitation [4] The fact is that the Labour government, which has been in power multiple times in the former suzerain of Pakistan, the UK, has long followed the Fabian socialist concept; India, which has a deep connection with Pakistan, has long implemented a socialist economic system. In Muslim countries similar to Pakistan, Egypt, South Yemen, Algeria, and Indonesia during President Sukarno's presidency all implemented varying degrees of socialist policies. Bhutto also used the example of Quraish donating their property following the teachings of the Prophet Muhammad to prove the implicit connection between socialism and Islamic faith: There were many among the Quraish who were big businessmen but they joined the ranks of the poor in following the Holy Prophet and surrendered their wealth for his cause because they believed in the truth of the cause. They believed, so they followed the right path in the service of Islam and sacrificed their personal interest. [5]

Ali Bhutto believes that socialism helps protect Islamic values, as capitalism, which is opposed to socialism, erodes Islamic values. Ali Bhutto pointed out in April 1968: Islam is our faith, and it is the basis of Pakistan. Pakistan cannot last without the supremacy of Islam. A socialist form of government does not rival that supremacy. On the contrary, socialism will make the whole population the custodian of Islamic values. By entrusting responsibility to a handful of capitalists, whom the Father of the Nation called 'men so selfish that it is difficult to reason with them', we are exposing the ideology of Pakistan to foreign influences. The entire population of Pakistan cannot be purchased by foreign powers. Only the vested interests having a common interest with foreign capital are susceptible to control by foreign powers. Indeed, they are the creatures of foreign powers. The hidden hand working through its agents has moved mercilessly in many underdeveloped nations of Asia, Africa and Latin America. Pakistan is not an exception. Foreign influence has been allowed to spread far and wide into Pakistan and, on a number of occasions, vital national interests have been compromised under foreign pressure. This must stop and it can only when the people take control. The entire population cannot be bribed or become a foreign agent. Thus, the Islamic ideology of this nation can be best preserved by the people of Pakistan and not by a handful of industrialists whose factories run on annual foreign subsidies. [4]

1.2 Socialism can Enhance Social and Economic Equality in Pakistan

Ali Bhutto's Islamic socialist theory advocates for equality in social and economic fields. Ali Bhutto's Islamic socialism originated from opposing the severe social inequality during President Ayub Khan's reign. Ali Bhutto proposed the theory of Islamic socialism, attempting to integrate public opinion and change Pakistan. Ali Bhutto established the Pakistan People's Party during his opposition to President Ayub Khan and mobilized the masses to oppose him using Islamic socialist theory. On October 26, 1968, Bhutto delivered a speech in Peshawar, using the common goal of equality pursued by Islam and socialism as a starting point, criticizing Pakistan under the Ayub Khan government for not being in line with the equality advocated by Islam. Bhutto pointed out: "What is the information of Islam? What is the foundation of Islam? Islam is based on equality. If Islam represents equality, how can the current system possibly conform to Islam (faith)? It cannot be called the Islamic system. [5] Ali Bhutto's remarks accuse the Ayub Khan government of implementing a system that is not in line with the Islamic faith and therefore lacks legitimacy.

Ali Bhutto believes that socialism can promote economic equality and social justice in Pakistan. In April 1968, Bhutto pointed out: The limited resources of this overpopulated country (Pakistan) are being wasted and the falling commodity prices in the international market diminish its capacity to purchase essentials from industrial countries. In such a situation socialism is the only answer to our economic problems. Socialism offers the only way to end exploitation and to foster unity. Unity will remain a slogan and an illusion until exploitation is ended. Only socialism that creates equal opportunities for all, prevents exploitation, and eliminates class differences can establish economic and social justice. [4]

Ali Bhutto also cited multiple Muslim countries and Mohamed Ali Jinnah as examples to support the positive value of socialism. On January 4, 1970, Ali Bhutto stated in a campaign public speech at Nishtar Park in Karachi: So far as socialism is concerned it is a programme for economic progress, just as democracy is a political programme. If we can be good Muslims by demanding democracy there is no reason why we cannot be as good as Muslims in Egypt, Iraq, Syria,

the Sudan and in Algeria. All these countries are Islamic countries and they have adopted a socialist pattern of economy. Why can't Pakistan do the same? If socialism had been against the interest of Pakistan our Quaid-i-Azam would not have said that he believed in Islamic Socialism.^[6]

1.3 Democracy must go Hand in Hand with Socialism

Ali Bhutto believes that democracy is the political system of Islamic socialism, but democracy itself is not an end; Democracy should go hand in hand with the economic equality and social justice advocated by socialism. Ali Bhutto pointed out in his speech in April 1968: The present conditions must give way to a democratic dispensation in which the entire population participates, feels that it is doing so and takes pride in it. In the same sweep it is essential to restore fundamental rights and mobilize the people of Pakistan to build an egalitarian society serving the needs of the people and at their command. All power must pass to the people. This can be done only by democracy. That is why "democracy is our polity."^[7]

Ali Bhutto believes that democracy is the political system of Islamic socialism, but democracy itself is not an end; Democracy should go hand in hand with the economic equality and social justice advocated by socialism. Ali Bhutto pointed out in his speech in April 1968: The current situation must give way to a democratic system where the people participate, feel that they are doing it, and feel proud of it. At the same time, it is also necessary to restore basic rights and mobilize the Pakistani people to build an equal society, meet their needs, and obey their instructions. All power must be handed over to the people. This can only be achieved through democracy. That is why democracy is our political system

In April 1968, Ali Bhutto pointed out when discussing the political situation in Pakistan: Democracy is essential but is not an end in itself. In the struggle to establish democracy we must never lose sight of the economic objectives, which remain paramount. Without economic progress a nation cannot find satisfaction in democracy alone. Democratic freedom is essential but economic equality and justice are supremely important. Profound changes in national life cannot come without economic changes. Economic problems remain pivotal. Democracy must go hand-in-hand with enlightened socialism if the servitude of the people is to be ended.^[4] In Pakistan, where Islamic believers dominate, the democratic political system and socialist economic system complement and promote each other. The combination of the two can help solve the many problems encountered in the economic development of Pakistan, a Muslim country, and is also the only way to ensure that the Pakistani people are free from exploitation and enhance unity.

On January 4, 1970, Ali Bhutto stated in a campaign public speech at Nishtar Park in Karachi: We have struggled for democracy. The people of Pakistan have struggled for democracy. In democracy the people are represented and their opinion carries weight. That is why the people of Pakistan want democracy and we have struggled for it. This struggle was not against our religion. There is no conflict between our religion and the principles of democracy. There is no party in Pakistan which does not stand for democracy. If democracy is not against Islam, the principles of equality are also not against Islam.^[6]

1.4 All Enterprises in Pakistan's National Economic Infrastructure must be Publicly Owned

In April 1968, Bhutto pointed out when discussing the political situation in Pakistan: In the scale of national wealth Pakistan stands at the lowest rung and there is nowhere else to be found an aggregate mass of human misery present in a similar area as that of Pakistan with its population of a hundred and twenty million. The region of the earth with the highest concentration of poverty is Pakistan. This stigma has to be wiped out by socialism. The immediate task would be to end predatory capitalism and to put socialism into motion. The means of production that are the generators of industrial advance or on which depend other industries must not be allowed to be vested in private hands. All enterprises that constitute the infrastructure of the national economy must be in public ownership.^[4]

At the same time, Bhutto stated that this does not mean eliminating the private economy and manufacturing monopolies: The control of the essential means of production and of the medium of exchange by the people does not mean that the private sector will be eliminated. Private entrepreneurs will be permitted to play their own useful role, but will not be able to create monopolistic preserves. The private sector must flourish under conditions proper to private enterprise, namely, those of competition, and not under the shield of state protection such as at present.^[4]

Bhutto also announced: We will never allow public ownership to degenerate into state capitalism. The workers will be encouraged to participate in the efficient running of the factories by appropriate incentives. Along with nationalization, steps will be undertaken to improve the condition of the wage-earners by providing for proper housing, recreation, health of the worker and his family, education of the children, and by any other ways that may help to raise his standard of living and cultural level. Conditions vary from place to place. The socialism applicable to Pakistan would be in conformity with its ideology and remain democratic in nature. There will be no foreign dictation. If there can be a Scandinavian form of socialism, there is no reason why there cannot be a Pakistani form of socialism suitable to our genius. "Socialism is our economy" because without socialism we shall not be able to attain genuine equality and unity, which are all the more precious to a nation geographically divided in two parts.^[4]

II The Islamic Socialist Policy Promoted during Ali Bhutto's Administration

The term Islamic socialism is controversial in Pakistan, so Bhutto has limited its scope of application. Bhutto believes that if Muslim countries such as Algeria, Egypt, Iraq, and Syria successfully achieve stability through Islamic socialism, then Pakistan can also achieve prosperity through this ideology. However, whether Islamic socialism and pure Islam contradict each other is a controversial issue.^[3] Therefore, the Pakistan People's Party did not use the term Islamic socialism in basic documents or election declarations. Bhutto and his leadership of the People's Party mainly limited socialism to the economic field.

On 26 April 1972, Bhutto interview with Der Spiegel at Lahore, he said: "We have our traditions and we stand by those and as far as socialism is concerned, we accept only that part of Marxism which is, which concerns economics. We accepted the limited part confined to its scientific, economic doctrine. We're not rigid. We say it's a very deep and penetrating study on economics. And whatever remains valid in our light and whatever remains beneficial to our country we must, with the passage of time, try to accept, use it as yardstick."^[8]

Ali Bhutto's Islamic socialist economic reform can be divided into two time periods: before October 1974 and after October 1974. Before October 1974, left-wing forces within the Bhutto government dominated the nationalization process in Pakistan, implementing the nationalization of private enterprises and education; After October 1974, the cabinet of the Bhutto government was reorganized, and the left lost power. In the second stage (1974-77), the Ali Bhutto government deviated from Islamic socialism and instead took care of the interests of religious parties. This is attributed to the development of the international situation after the rise in oil prices in 1973. This strengthens the position of the Arab world led by Saudi Arabia. Given the increasingly close ties between Pakistan and the Arab world, Islam has gained more attention in Pakistan. The ideological shift of the Pakistan People's Party led by Bhutto from Islamic socialism has led to setbacks in the economic reform of Islamic socialism. ^[1, p. 161] During the Ali Bhutto era, Islamic socialism in Pakistan was mainly reflected in the economic field, including nationalization of industrial and financial institutions, land reform, labor reform, education reform, etc.

2.1 Nationalization of Industrial and Financial Institutions

Ali Bhutto promised in his PPP declaration to nationalize all basic industries and financial institutions. Within a month of Ali Bhutto taking over the government, the basic content of this commitment was achieved. In January 1972, the Ali Bhutto government announced a nationalization plan aimed at allowing the public to "take over" 10 "basic" industries: steel, base metals, heavy engineering, motor vehicle assembly and manufacturing, tractor assembly and manufacturing, heavy and basic chemicals, petrochemicals, water sludge, and utilities. State owned life insurance companies are also under government control. Nationalization is not pure nationalization, and the government chooses to only take over the management of enterprises without assuming ownership. ^[9, p. 114] This has led to the concentration of capital-intensive industries in Pakistan in the government's state-owned sector. The total assets of these enterprises reach 200 million US dollars, and their output value accounts for less than 12.8% of the domestic product, only 3.4% of the national labor force, and 8.3% of Pakistan's exports.^[10]

Ali Bhutto designated nationalization of banks, vegetable oil, and textile industries. On August 16, 1972, Bhutto announced the nationalization of the vegetable oil industry, claiming that the bosses of oil extraction companies would find it difficult to make a fortune. Compared to the previous state-owned enterprises, these oil extraction enterprises are all small and medium-sized enterprises. Some of them are active supporters of the Pakistan People's Party, while many others have a favorable impression of the party. Therefore, the government's nationalization of the vegetable oil industry has led to dissatisfaction among its supporters and sparked public anger. Supporters of the People's Party demand that the government replace economic decision-makers. ^[9, p. 117]

Although Ali Bhutto's nationalization has offended supporters of the vegetable oil industry, it has won the favor of cotton producers, another strong supporter of PPP. After the Bhutto government took over cotton production, economic decision-making was chaotic due to government officials lacking basic knowledge and funding in the industry. This deeply harms the farmers who grow cotton. However, due to Ali Bhutto's nationalization being only the nationalization of management rights and not affecting the entry of foreign capital, the impact on the cotton industry is relatively small. ^[9, pp. 187-198]

In January 1974, Pakistan nationalized private banks. The government has taken over the ownership, management, and control of private shares of banks. The Bhutto government also took over the management of oil sales companies and shipbuilding enterprises. By the end of March 1973, Pakistan had 23 banks, including 8 foreign banks. The 15 private banks that have been nationalized have 2906 branches, accounting for 98.8% of the total number of branches in all Pakistani banks, 94% of deposits in all Pakistani banks, and 89.4% of total loans. After announcing the nationalization of banks, the finance minister of the Bhutto government, Mubashir Hassan, immediately announced that the promises made by the People's Party in the 1970 election manifesto had been fully realized. ^[9, p. 118]

2.2 Land Reform

Bhutto explained the purpose of land reform: to end centuries of oppression and unfair agricultural systems that people have silently endured, to abolish the cursed feudal system and the unfair burden on farmers. He wants to bring human dignity to the farmers in Pakistan, making them feel proud and proud. He claims that his land reform fundamentally solves rural problems and fundamentally improves the economic and social status of farmers.

In March 1972, the Bhutto government announced a series of land reform measures, reducing the maximum limit of personal ownership of irrigated land to 150 acres and non-irrigated land to 300 acres; Land exceeding these limits will be reclaimed by the state without compensation to the homeowners, and ultimately transferred to the tenant, who will receive it for free. No longer deducting previously owned orchards, hunting grounds, land for raising horses and other livestock, land for religious sites, etc; Reform water fees and land taxes; Require landlords and tenants to share the investment cost equally; It is prohibited to expel tenants unless they are unwilling to pay rent or the landlord's share of the harvest; Cancel the additional taxes and labor imposed on tenants in the past. ^[12, P.228] Bhutto hopes that enlightened farmers will bring sustained growth in agricultural production. The land reform of the Bhutto government has benefited some small and medium-sized farmers and landless farmers.

The reform of Bhutto did not bring about significant class changes in rural society. Pakistan is still: farmers will own small plots of land, while a few landowners will own a large proportion of arable land. Land interest groups - large landlords and medium-sized farmers - continue to dominate rural areas economically and politically. Despite Bhutto's verbal demand for land reform in rural areas, the reality has not changed significantly. ^[9, P.139] From a practical perspective, the landlord class still supports Bhutto's People's Party. Therefore, it can be said that the land reform led by Bhutto did not touch the fundamental interests of the landlord class.

2.3 Labor Reform

When Bhutto came to power, the economic system of the 19th century was still prevalent in Pakistan. Military rulers encourage business owners to ignore the working conditions and interests of workers, only emphasizing personal profits, and harming the interests of workers and the country. Employers do not care about the welfare of workers and force them to work day and night to maintain their oligopoly. The People's Party emphasizes the protection of workers' interests in its policy vision. ^[13, P.132]

In the 1970 general election, the People's Party won the support of some trade unions on the basis of promising to significantly improve working conditions and raise the minimum wage. These commitments have also won the support of some within the party, who believe that labor reform is an important step towards improving income distribution in urban areas. ^[9, P.120]

On February 10, 1972, Bhutto announced the implementation of a new labor policy: a commitment to improving workers' work, housing, educational environment, and salary benefits; Utilize labor courts and labor laws to protect the basic interests of workers, implement a shop steward system, enhance the current law's ability to quickly handle labor disputes, and restore the collective bargaining rights of bank employees; Encourage workers to effectively participate in enterprise management and increase their share of annual profit distribution, from 2% during the Ayyub Khan regime in 1968 to 4%. It is estimated that the number of factories in which workers effectively participate in enterprise management accounted for 20% of the total number of factories at that time. The government also announced that if workers succeed in increasing productivity, they will receive an additional 20% share from the increased profits. ^[10, P.136]

However, the scope of application of labor laws has changed, increasing the operational burden on small businesses. According to the 1964 Labor Law Regulations, the labor law applies to enterprises that "employ 10 or more people". Out of the 2.2 million people employed in the manufacturing industry, approximately 570000 works in these "registered" enterprises. The 1972 reform changed the definition of "registering" a company, lowering the threshold from 10 to 5, "benefiting an additional 1.2 million workers from the benefits of the reform. But the change in definition shocked the holders of 155000 small businesses; They were excluded from the 1970 Declaration, and no leader mentioned it after the People's Party took office. The result of the reform is that small entrepreneurs find themselves now bound not only by the new legislation being implemented, but also by other regulations on labor welfare. The cost for small business owners to comply with the new labor regulations is much higher than for large enterprises. ^[9, P.121]

2.4 Educational Reform

During Ali Bhutto's reign, education in Pakistan was very backward, with only 43% of school-age children attending school. This means that 7 million children are not attending school, of which approximately 5 million are girls. The state's funding for primary, secondary, higher, and vocational education only accounted for 1.7% of the gross domestic product in 1972, while the average education expenditure in developing countries at that time accounted for 4.6% of the gross domestic product, almost three times that of Pakistan. ^[9, P.121]

In fact, due to political reasons, the field of education reform is considered very important. Teacher associations, college students, the middle class, and the urban poor all demand reform. Teachers urge the government to nationalize all educational institutions; The University Student Association hopes to participate more in management; The middle class is dissatisfied with the quality of education provided by public and private schools, demanding improvements in curriculum and student discipline; The poor hope that the government will provide more resources for primary and functional education. For various reasons, the left wing of the Pakistan People's Party sympathizes with the demands of teachers. Therefore, it chose the nationalization of schools and universities as a tool to "prepare the education sector in Pakistan to meet the needs of modern and vibrant society". ^[9, P.126] Ali Bhutto took office on December 20, 1971, and his educational reform policies had a profound impact. The Bhutto education reform policy emphasizes the expansion and strengthening of technical training in various fields, with the main goal of private schools and colleges, and the main purpose of placing these institutions under national control. The education reform policy has also been implemented quickly and on schedule.

On March 15, 1972, Bhutto said that in order to catch up with the rapid development of science in the world today, the goal of educational reform policies is what the people and the public hope for. At the same time, he also announced the implementation of the "16 point education plan", which includes establishing libraries in rural areas and improving teacher treatment. By September of the same year, 175 private schools had been taken over by the government's Ministry of Education. Bhutto's education policy has successfully adapted to the educational needs of the urban poor. The new education policy stipulates that it will be implemented in two stages: the first stage, starting from October 1, 1972, will provide free education for school-age children under the age of 13; In 1974, it was the second and second stage, providing compulsory free education for all school-age children under the age of 15. Free education reduces the burden of raising children in families, promotes social civilization, and improves workers. However, a large number of children are still out of school because their parents cannot afford the losses caused by not going to work.^[9, P.129-130]

By September 1, 1972, approximately 175 private universities were placed under the management of provincial education departments. Private schools with more numbers and types were nationalized in stages, lasting for two years from October 1972 to September 1974. When the left was relieved of more important positions in the central cabinet, most of the education sector was already under direct government control. Only over 20 schools - including St. Mary's College in Rawalpindi, Boom College in Abbottabad, St. Joseph's School, and Grammar School in Karachi - are still under private control. Exempt institutions are managed by foreign missionaries: the decision not to nationalize them is consistent with the decision to limit the nationalization of economic and social institutions to institutions owned and managed by Pakistani nationals.^[9, P.124]

III The Impact of Ali Bhutto's Islamic Socialism

Although Ali Bhutto's practice of Islamic socialism in Pakistan did not last long, it profoundly changed the appearance of Pakistan. The three years of Islamic socialist practice from 1972 to 1974 have had a profound impact on Pakistan, with both positive and negative impacts. The impact of Ali Bhutto's Islamic socialism mainly includes the following aspects:

3.1 Ali Bhutto's Practice of Islamic Socialism has had A Profound Impact on Pakistan's Economy

The Islamic socialist economic policy implemented by Bhutto enhances Pakistan's industrial and agricultural strength. Bhutto laid a solid foundation for the prosperity of the agricultural and industrial sectors. Pakistan has since achieved self-sufficiency in materials such as fertilizers, sucrose, and cement.^[13, P.138] The nationalization that began in 1972 made half of Pakistan's manufacturing sector state-owned.^[13, P.139]

However, Ali Bhutto implemented Islamic socialist economic reform without making economic plans in advance, resulting in chaotic economic decision-making. In addition, some economic decisions made by Ali Bhutto are not based on economic knowledge, but rather on ideological considerations. After 1973, large state-owned enterprises in Pakistan fell into economic stagnation. The investment of state-owned enterprises has significantly increased, while the investment of private enterprises has sharply decreased.^[13, P.139] This has led to financial budget deficits, inflation and other economic problems in the Pakistani economy, and has become one of the reasons for long-term problems in the Pakistani economy.^[3]

3.2 Ali Bhutto's Islamic Socialist Practice Strengthening Secularist Politics in Pakistan

Ali Bhutto's practice of Islamic socialism significantly strengthens Pakistan's secularist political tendencies. This is mainly reflected in three aspects: weakening sectarianism, establishing a political discourse that prioritizes economy over politics, and reducing the possibility of military intervention in politics. Ali Bhutto's Islamic socialist economic policy symbolizes secularism rather than sectarianism in terms of ideology. Whenever Muslim countries emphasize the role of religion in politics, it only leads to sectarianism. Sectarianism is an important cause of national division.^[3] After implementing Islamic socialist economic policies in Pakistan, sectarianism was greatly restricted, and the Pakistani economy was able to improve.

At the same time, Ali Bhutto's implementation of Islamic socialism attempted to mobilize the general public of Pakistan to participate in political reforms, thereby reaching out to the general public more widely than previous Pakistani regimes. This widespread mobilization of the masses to participate in politics promotes the awakening of political consciousness among the Pakistani people, which not only helps the democratic development of Pakistan, but also helps Pakistan avoid military intervention in politics.

3.3 Ali Bhutto's Practice of Islamic Socialism Led to the Outflow of Capital and Human Resources

Ali Bhutto's practice of Islamic socialism has led to a significant outflow of capital and human resources from Pakistan. The expansion of state-owned enterprises, the weakening of business confidence, and the sharp increase in the share of employee wages in industrial income have had a profound impact on industrial development, leading entrepreneurs and their capital and management experience to flow from Pakistan to foreign countries. Many business owners are deeply disappointed with the increasingly harsh business environment in Pakistan and have turned to other countries for business operations. For example, the Saigol family began operating in Tanzania and Kenya in Africa, as well as the United Arab Emirates in the Middle East. The "Service" company acquired local enterprises in Tanzania, Africa, and Saudi Arabia in the Middle East, and then began operations. The Halon family began operating in New York, USA and London, UK. Ali Bhutto's practice of Islamic socialism has led to a significant outflow of capital and human resources from Pakistan. The expansion of state-owned enterprises, the weakening of business confidence, and the sharp increase in the share of employee wages in industrial income have had a profound impact on industrial development, leading entrepreneurs and

their capital and management experience to flow from Pakistan to foreign countries. Many business owners are deeply disappointed with the increasingly harsh business environment in Pakistan and have turned to other countries for business operations. For example, the Saigol family began operating in Tanzania and Kenya in Africa, as well as the United Arab Emirates in the Middle East. The "Service" company acquired local enterprises in Tanzania, Africa, and Saudi Arabia in the Middle East, and then began operations. The Halon family began operating in New York, USA and London, UK. ^[9, P.118]

3.4 Ali Bhutto's Practice of Islamic Socialism to Improve the Education Level of the Urban Poor

Ali Bhutto's practice of Islamic socialism has achieved some success in meeting the wishes of the urban poor. Bhutto's education policy requires the implementation of a two-stage program that allows all Pakistani children under the age of 15 to receive free education. In the first phase, which began on October 1, 1972, education for all Pakistani children under the age of 13 was free but not mandatory. The second stage will begin in two years, and the goal of compulsory education will eventually be achieved. Free education has deeply moved Pakistani parents who hope to send their children to school but cannot afford the small tuition fees charged by public schools. However, most impoverished children in Pakistan are still out of school because their parents urgently need them to work and earn money instead of going to school for education. ^[9, P.129] For these Pakistani families, educating their children is very uneconomical. According to a study, the economic return on education for Pakistani children is as low as 6%. This indicates that the opportunity cost for Pakistani parents to educate their children is high, but the economic rewards of dropping out of school and going to work are extremely tempting. Moreover, school education in Pakistan has little help in improving productivity and job pay. Therefore, the enrollment rate of children in Pakistan increased by only 8% annually between 1972 and 1974. At this rate, given the annual population growth of over 3%, the Pakistani government cannot achieve the goal of universal education for children by the end of the 20th century. Despite these difficulties, education reform remains attractive to the urban poor. Even if the urban poor are unwilling to immediately let their children give up their jobs to receive education, they are still very satisfied. Because if one day they want their children to go to school, education is still free and they don't need to pay any fees for their children's education. ^[9, P.130]

3.5 Ali Bhutto's Islamic Socialist Practices have had A Profound Impact on Agriculture

Ali Bhutto's practice of Islamic socialism has had a profound impact on Pakistan's agriculture. The land reform in 1972 brought about changes to the land allocation structure in Pakistan. The restrictions have changed the phenomenon of land being concentrated among a few landlords. The law prohibiting landlords from expelling tenants has raised the political, economic, and social status of tenants. Lease reform allows tenant farmers to gain economic benefits. The redistribution of land freed tenant farmers from the control of landlords, resulting in a large number of self-employed farmers with independent political status. Pakistan's tenant farmers, who have suffered economic exploitation, social oppression, political dependence on landlords, have become self-farmers with higher political independence, better economic status. ^[13, P.139] Ali Bhutto implements a policy of purchasing agricultural products at high prices in order to provide the agricultural sector with as much remaining development funds as possible, and provides significant subsidies for agricultural products purchased at high prices, allowing them to be sold to urban consumers at extremely low rationing prices. The difference between the high procurement price and the low allocation price will be balanced by funding provided by the Pakistani government. However, the high purchase price paid by the Pakistani government for food has not had a significant impact on the production of Pakistani farmers. Only when the production costs of agricultural producers do not increase proportionally will high purchase prices translate into substantial incentives for agricultural producers. However, from 1973 to 1974, the actual cost for wheat farmers to purchase agricultural production materials was more than twice that of the 1960s. Between the mid-1960s and the late 1970s, agricultural costs doubled. This had a restraining effect on agricultural production during Bhutto's reign and led to a stagnation of agricultural development. ^[9, P.157]

IV Conclusion

The practice of Islamic socialism by former Pakistani Prime Minister Ali Bhutto holds an important position in Pakistan's development process. Ali Bhutto's theory of Islamic socialism holds that socialism is applicable to Muslim countries such as Pakistan. Socialism can promote social and economic equality in Pakistan, democracy and socialism must develop together, and all enterprises in Pakistan's national economic infrastructure must be public enterprises. Ali Bhutto's Islamic socialist policies include nationalization of industrial and financial institutions, land reform, labor reform, and education reform. Although Ali Bhutto's socialist practice ultimately ended in setbacks, it deeply influenced Pakistan's development process. Pakistan's industrial and agricultural foundation is more solid. As a result, Pakistani society is more likely to approach left-wing progressive values and pay more attention to the lives of ordinary citizens. The left-wing political parties in Pakistan's political spectrum have more ideological resources. The Bhutto family in Pakistani politics has gained more national recognition, understanding, and sympathy, leading to the rise of Prime Minister Benazir Bhutto and the rise of Birawal Bhutto. Although Ali Bhutto and his promotion of Islamic socialist practice are extremely far from the present, they are still deeply influencing Pakistan's present and future.

Funding: This article is a general project of the National Social Science Foundation of China, "On the Impact and Countermeasures of the Afghan Taliban's Coming to Power on the China-Pakistan Economic Corridor" (Project No. 23BGJ074); and the research results of the Yunnan Academy of Social Sciences and the China (Kunming) Institute of

South and Southeast Asian Studies in the direction of India's Indo-Pacific strategy in the discipline of international relations. This paper is supported by the Research Initiation Grant Project of Southwest Minzu University, "On the Impact of Afghanistan's Changes on China-Pakistan Economic Corridor and Countermeasures" (Project No. RQD2022010), and the key project of the Center for Pakistan Studies of China West Normal University, "On Progress, Resistance and Countermeasures of the Belt and Road Initiative in South Asia" (Project No. PSC22ZD01)

References

- [1]. Li Dechang, "Political Development in Pakistan," Sichuan University Press, Chengdu, China, 1989.
- [2]. Zhang Shulan, "Analysis on the Revival of Pakistan's Communist Movement in the 21st Century," *Socialism Studies*, vol. 258, no. 4, pp. 131-138, Aug 2021.
- [3]. Bidanda M. Chengappa, "Pakistan: Impact of Islamic Socialism," *Strategic Analysis*, vol. 26, no. 1, pp. 27-47, 2002.
- [4]. Ali Bhutto, "Political Situation in Pakistan," April, 1968, <https://bhutto.org/index.php/speeches/speeches-from-1966-1969/political-situation-in-pakistan-a-pamphlet-april-1968/> (accessed Oct. 2023)
- [5]. Ali Bhutto, "Political Situation in Pakistan," April, 1968, <https://bhutto.org/index.php/speeches/speeches-from-1966-1969/political-situation-in-pakistan-a-pamphlet-april-1968/> (accessed Oct. 2023)
- [6]. Ali Bhutto, "This System is Wrong Address to Party Workers," October 26, 1968, <https://bhutto.org/index.php/speeches/speeches-from-1966-1969/this-system-is-wrong-address-to-party-workers-peshawar-october-26-1968/> (accessed Oct. 2023)
- [7]. Ali Bhutto, "Launching the Election Campaign Public Speech in Nishtar Park," January 4, 1970, <https://bhutto.org/index.php/speeches/speeches-from-1970-1971/launching-the-election-campaign-public-speech-in-nishtar-park-karachi-january-4-1970/> (accessed Oct. 2023)
- [8]. Ali Bhutto, "Reforms," April, 1968, <https://bhutto.org/index.php/speeches/speeches-from-1966-1969/political-situation-in-pakistan-a-pamphlet-april-1968/> (accessed Oct. 2023)
- [9]. Ali Bhutto, "Transcript of interview with Der Spiegel at Lahore," April 26, 1972, <https://bhutto.org/index.php/speeches/speeches-delivered-in-1972/transcript-of-interview-with-der-spiegel-at-lahore-on-april-26-1972/> (accessed Oct. 2023)
- [10]. Shahid Javed Burki, "Pakistan under Bhutto, 1971-1977," The Macmillan Press Ltd, London, UK, 1980.
- [11]. Anwar H. Syed, "The Discourse and Politics of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto," St. Martin's Press, New York, America, 1992.
- [12]. Robert La Porte, "Pakistan in 1972: Pick Up Pieces," *Asian Survey*, vol. 13, no.2 , pp.187-198, Feb, 1973.
- [13]. Surendra Nath Kaushik, "Pakistan Under Bhutto's Leadership," Uppal Publishing House, New Delhi, India, 1985.
- [14]. Xiang Wenhua, "Research on the Pakistan People's Party," People's Publishing House, Beijing, China, 2015.